SAN DIEGO MESA COLLEGE (SDMC)
ACADEMIC SENATE (AS)
Virtual Meeting
November 28, 2022
2:20PM – 4:20PM
MINUTES

Present:

Academic Senate President John Crocitti, Carlynne Allbee, Isaac Arguelles-Ibarra, Janna Braun, Henry Browne, Nellie Dougherty, Ian Duckles, Justin Estep, Rob Fremland, Sakeenah Gallardo, Veronica Gerace, Helen Greenbergs, Alison Gurganus, Mary Gwin, Andrew Hoffman, Geoff Johnson, Janue Johnson, Candace Katungi, Jesse Keller, Cesar López, Laura Maki, Thekima Mayasa, Dina Miyoshi, Jill Moreno Ikari, Katherine Naimark, Alison Primoza, Anthony Reuss, Robert Sanchez, Jessica Sardo, Kristian Secor, Irena Stojimirovic, Judy Sundayo, Karen Wait, Sandra Watts and Guests Vice Chancellor Susan Topham, Dean Brian Weston, Uriel Ornelas, Hannah Padilla-Barajas, Kelly Spoon, Oscar V. Torres, and Robert Wong

Absent:

Gina Abbiate (Proxy to Naimark), Michael Brewer (Excused), Rosiangela Escamilla, Rob Fremland (Proxy to Sardo – Draft Agenda/Minutes Votes), Inna Kanevsky, Natalie Mapes (Proxy to Abe), George Svoboda (Excused) and Walter "Duane" Wesley

I. **CALL TO ORDER & WELCOME** by Academic Senate President John Crocitti @ 2:23PM.
Parliamentarian – None/Timekeeper – TBD/Speaker Coordinator – TBD

II. **APPROVAL OF DRAFT AGENDA**:
  A. President John Crocitti reported Manuel Vélez is not available for the "Academic Freedom" presentation today.
    1. Manuel Vélez will have a presentation on "Academic Freedom" on December 12, 2022.
  B. President John Crocitti added "Participatory Governance" to the Round Table discussion.
  C. President Elect Andrew Hoffman submitted changes to the draft agenda and minutes regarding the California Virtual Campus (CVC).
  Motion to approve with changes from John Crocitti and Andrew Hoffman:

M/S	Gerace/Gallardo	**26 APPROVE**
		Abbiate
		(Proxy to Naimark)
		Fremland
		(Proxy to Sardo)
		Mapes
		(Proxy to Abe)

III. **PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS**:
  A. **Associated Student Government**: President Phoebe Truong (Not Present)
  B. **Classified Professionals**: Courtney Lee
    1. We are still focusing on the leadership transition from the last academic year to the current academic year.

IV. **PUBLIC COMMENTS**: None

V. **APPROVAL OF DRAFT MINUTES**: November 7, 2022
  Motion to Approve:

M/S	Duckles/Gallardo	**26 APPROVE**
		Abbiate
		(Proxy to Naimark)
		Fremland
		(Proxy to Sardo)
		Mapes
		(Proxy to Abe)

VI.   GUESTS:

A. Vice Chancellor Susan Topham & Dean Brian Weston - The CA Virtual Campus (CVC) and OEI:

1. Dean Brian Weston's November 9, 2022 Committee of Chairs Presentation:
   a. Purpose:
      - Allows Students currently enrolled in a California Community College (CCC) to instantly enroll in online courses offered at eligible colleges without filling out a separate application.
   b. Emergency Conditions Memo:
      - What is it? A memo from the CCC Chancellor's Office that tied emergency funds to a set of expectations for the colleges that accepted emergency funds.
      - Some of the expectations relate to @ONE and some of the expectations relate to the Course Exchange.
      - The CCC Chancellor's Office June 14th Memo (FS 22-07) detailed the COVID 19 Emergency Conditions Allowance eligibility requirements.
   c. CVC Steps to Meeting the Emergency Conditions Allowance Requirements:
      - September 1, 2022: CEO/College President signs the Consortium Agreement.
      - January 1, 2023 Implementation:
        * Implement Becoming a Home College
        * Implement/Commit to Becoming a Teaching College
        * Commit to Joining a College Implementation Cohort
        * Incentivize and Prioritize Participation in Professional Development (PD) to Improve Online Teaching and Learning (Including @ONE and Peer Online Course Review (POCR) Training)
   d. Becoming a Home College and a Teaching College:
      - Home College:
        * Establish Canvas Trust Relationship
        * Enable Canvas API
        * Confirm the CCC Tech Center IdP Proxy Configuration and Verify the Passing of Required Student Attributes.
        * Assign Credentials to A&R and FA Staff to Use Administrative Panel
        * Enable Transcripts for Receiving
        * Sign Federal Financial Aide Consortium Agreement
        * Home College's classes will show up at the top of the search result list regardless of the number of "Badges" the Faculty Members have earned.
      - Teaching College:
        * Enable e-Transcript for Sending
        * Enable SuperGlue
   e. @ONE and the Emergency Conditions Memo:
      - One of the Requirements is to Incentivize and Prioritize Participation in Professional Development (PD) to Improve Online Teaching and Learning (Including @ONE Courses and POCR Training)
   f. Impact on Faculty and Curriculum:
      - Peer Online Course Review:
        * Which Courses are Listed?
        * Current Badging?
   g. CVC/@ONE Local POCR Reframing:
      - Goal:
        * To quickly and significantly increase the number of fully certified Local POCR teams and aligned courses.
      - Strategy:
        * Accelerate Local POCR team training and course review processes
        * Move badging authority to a Local POCR team and position CVC/@ONE team as trainers and support
      - Reminder:
        * Having a Local POCR team and process is required per the CVC Master Consortium Agreement. (But, we do not have to enforce Appendix A, Section 2b, which requires incremental benchmarks and alignment of 20% of courses/sections. Consider them aspirational goals.)

- POCR Chaffey College Data after Implementation:
  * There was a 12% increase in online course success rates after POCR alignment
  * Success rates increased by 32% for Black Students and 24% for Students ages 25 to 29 years old.

h. Exchange Enrollment Data: October 2020 – August 2022
- 1,043,009 Unique Course Searches
- 23,896 Redirects to CCCApply
- 2,411 Cross Enrollments:
  * Nearly 20% enroll at their home college
  * 81% cross-enroll in only one course per term
- Top Subject Search Terms: Biology, Chemistry, Computer Information Science and Mathematics

i. Implementation Progress:
- 73 Home Colleges
- 57 Live Schedule Data Colleges
- 20 Teaching Colleges (35 Projected by year-end)

j. Questions:
- Will all courses have to be listed in the consortium or will the college be able to select specific ones?
  * Vice Chancellor Susan Topham reported Home Colleges decide how many seats they will offer on the exchange.
- Do Faculty have to adapt their online courses to meet specific CVC requirements?

k. Dean Weston reminded the SDMC AS that our district is still being "Held Harmless" in regards to state funding.

2. Vice Chancellor (VC) Susan Topham:
   a. VC Topham reported the number of Students participating in the CVC is very small right now.
   b. We will not have open seats available on the exchange until SDMC and district Students have enrolled in classes.
   c. Can we adjust the cap on Students entering our courses if we see that we need more enrollment in a particular course?
      - VC Topham said the district already has Academic Policy (AP) 5260 in place to address Prerequisites, Corequisites, Limitations on Enrollment and Advisories issues.
   d. VC Topham and Dean Weston will attend a meeting regarding funding availability after the initial emergency funding is gone.
   e. We recognize that we will need more funding if the CVC increases SDMC and district enrollment a great deal.
   f. We have to meet with the State Chancellor's Office regularly to make sure we are doing what we are required to do under the agreements the district signed.
   g. We are being methodical and we are asking for feedback from SDMC and the other colleges in our district.
   h. We can review our processes, but we have to make sure the processes we adopt are not discriminatory.
   i. How do you divide financial aid awards when a Student attends more than one college and/or district?
   j. We have to make sure that we are making decisions that are in the best interest of our Students.
   k. We have to make sure our Students acquire the knowledge they need to transfer to a four-year institution.
   l. Joining the CVC consortium puts our district up by $20 million.
   m. The goal is not to put all our classes online.
   n. We do not have the resources necessary to meet the requirements of any additional initiatives from the state.
   o. We will figure this out together.
   p. We need to be compliant with our CVC agreements.
   q. We need to make sure all our support services are available to all our Students.
   r. We are bound to the CVC consortium, but we do not know if we will continue to receive the funding necessary to participate in the consortium.
   s. VC Topham will find out if legal actions have been taken regarding the acceptance of course credit for distance education courses available on the consortium that are not approved for distance education at the Home College.

3. As reported by President John Crocitti:
   a. "I asked the following:

      - Can Students from CSU and UC enroll in CVC courses?

        * A Student must be enrolled in at least three (3) units at a CA Community College (CCC). (Their CCC must be designated as their Home Campus.)

      - When the Emergency Condition Allowance ends, can SDCCD withdraw from CVC?

        * No.

      - Is the POCR certification run by the District or at the colleges?"

        * The POCR is at the college level.

4. Can we adjust the cap on Students entering our courses if we see that we need more enrollment in a particular course?
   a. Yes.
      - We have a district policy in place.

B. Manuel Vélez - Academic Freedom Presentation: Postponed until December 12, 2022

VII. REPORTS:
A. Committee Reports:
1. <u>Senate Executive Committees</u>:
   a. *Academic Affairs Committee*: Chair Mary Gwin
      - We are still reviewing the San Diego Mesa College (SDMC) Academic Senate (AS) Constitution.

   b. *Professional Advancement Committee (PAC)*: Chair Janna Braun

      As reported by Janna Braun:

      - "The final professional advancement deadline for Fall 2022 is Wednesday, November 30. Any paperwork submitted after that date will be held over until the first PAC meeting in Spring 2023 on Feb. 1.
      - Sabbatical leave applications for the 2023-24 academic year are due on March 1, 2023. Please see the email I sent earlier today (Nov. 28) for additional details.
      - There will be a Flex presentation about sabbaticals and professional advancement on January 26 at a time TBD."

   c. *Committee of Chairs (COC)*: Chair of Chairs Jill Moreno Ikari (No Report)

   d. *Curriculum Review Committee (CRC)*: Faculty Co-Chair Justin Estep
      As reported by Justin Estep:
      "There was no CIC last week, but we did have CRC the week before.

      Last CRC of the Fall is December 1.

      Last CIC of the Fall is December 8.

      Please continue to work on 2/6 year reviews. Thank you!"

e. *Program Review Committee (PRC)*: Acting Faculty Co-Chair Dina Miyoshi (5 Minutes)

As reported by Dina Miyoshi:

"The Nuventive build for Program Review is nearing completion. Focus then should turn to pilot testing and training. The Program Review Steering Committee meeting is this Friday where the Program Review timeline will continue to be discussed."

2. Other Committees:

a. *The Committee for Diversity Action, Inclusion & Equity (CDAIE)*: Chair Judy Sundayo

As reported by Judy Sundayo:

- "CDAIE last met on 11-4-22.
- The campus continues celebrations of Native American Heritage Month, the Day of the Dead, and Hip Hop History Month.
- Professor Michael Cox hosted Native American speaker, Dina Gilio-Whitaker, on Environmental Justice for Tribal Communities in California Ocean Conservation, which took place earlier today, in LRC 435.
- Consistent with our campus' interest in establishing an enduring relationship with local native communities, as part of our emerging Land Acknowledgement, Chair continues collaboration on a Native American Heritage event for Cultural Unity Week, April 17 - 21st.
- Chair continues to advise the Student Diversity Club, which is currently planning a December display in the Mesa LRC atrium on Winter/Fall Religious & Cultural Practices & Traditions.
- In addition to other November observances, November 20th marked the annual observance of Transgender Day of Remembrance (TDOR).
- Sadly, Nov. 20th was also the day a 22 yr. old gunman opened fire in an LGBTQIA nightclub in Colorado Springs, Colorado, killing 5 people and wounding 25. The Mesa Pride Center responded to this tragedy by sending out a communication offering kind words and resources for those in the campus community needing support."
- The Mesa Pride Center still plans to its Grand Opening to take place on February 8th, 10 am - 2 pm, with the opening ceremony at 11 am
- Chair has completed collaborations with the Black Studies Dept. for Black History Month (February) 2023.
- The Women's Alliance is currently planning for Women's History Month 2023
- Chair continues to meet with Carl Luna on organizing a series of Civility Trainings for Mesa college, based on the "Dinner and a Fight" training out of Arizona State University, which uses the 5-Chairs method of communication and dialogue to approach civility, personal conduct, awareness and choice in difficult conversations. The intention is to have several Mesa College employees trained in the method and then to have a series of train the trainers' events taking place over time throughout the campus. Please e-mail Judy if you're interested in participating in the training, or in being part of the audience which will be observing the process.
- CDAIE meets next **Friday, Dec. 2, 2022 from** 9 am - 11 am. Anyone wanting to attend as a guest may send an e-mail to jsundayo@sdccd.edu for the Zoom link"

b. *Mesa Pathways Committee (MPC)*: No Report

c. *Other Committee Reports*: None

3. Senate Executive Officer Reports:

a. *President Elect*: Andrew Hoffman

As reported by Andrew Hoffman:

"Tomorrow, November 29, I will be participating as a panelist in a statewide webinar for the AB111 Common Course Numbering system. I will be representing as someone who has worked with curriculum in this district for many years. Of course, we have aligned curriculum in our district, and CCN is not exactly the same as that. I will be addressing the benefits and challenges we have faced here at Mesa College and across our district due to our aligned curriculum. An invitation link to the webinar has been sent out to all faculty who wish to participate."

b. *Vice President*: Sakeenah Gallardo (No Report)

c. *Secretary*: Vacant

d. *Treasurer*: Thekima Mayasa
- We successfully renewed the SDMC AS Student Scholarships for this academic year.
- We will award one (1) additional $500.00 scholarships this year.
  - * One of our recipients was not able to claim their scholarship last year.
- We are forming the Review Committee to review this year's scholarship applications.
- We had approximately $4,000.00 in our checking and savings accounts at the beginning of fall 2022.
  - * We spent $1,000.00 on President Elect Andrew Hoffman's course.
  - * We will award three (3) $500.00 scholarships this academic year.

e. *Senator at Large (1)*: Veronica Gerace

As reported by Veronica Gerace:

> "San Diego Mesa College
> Academic Senate
> 28 November 2022 Meeting Summary
> by
> Veronica Gerace, Ed.D., Senator-at-Large 1

Mesa's Triple D series (Dynamic Dialogue & Dessert) - begins on December 8th, 2:30 - 4pm. Triple D is an opportunity to dialogue about important topics which impact their teaching such as how equity impacts course rigor, attendance, etc. Faculty may earn Flex credit and the desserts are being prepared by the Culinary Arts Program students. Flier attached.

Students with Dependents - Mesa is one of 8 higher education institutions to take part in the Family U program (Generation Hope) to ensure that our campus is best prepared to help students with dependents succeed. A campus committee comprised of faculty and other campus constituents on campus will work with our Basic Needs Professionals (BPN) to share ideas and support the BNP efforts. If you have suggestions or questions, please share them with Veronica. A video was shown about the program.
Link: https://www.generationhope.org/familyucohort"

f. *Senator at Large (2)*: Vacant

g. *President*: John Crocitti (No Report)

VIII. NEW BUSINESS:

A. Resolution 2022.11.1 – Processes for the California Virtual College (CVC): Fremland

As reported by Rob Fremland:
"Very specifically,

CVC offers online laboratory courses which, if a student takes, we are FORCED to accept for credit. Virtual labs are inappropriate and are not equivalent to FTF labs. Our professional organization, The American Chemical Society has guidelines that clearly state that "Chemistry is an empirical science that requires the safe and effective physical manipulation of materials, equipment, and instrumentation. This hands-on expertise cannot be developed through virtual laboratory exercises. *Virtual and computer-simulated labs may supplement hands-on laboratory exercises, but they must not replace them.*

In addition, many of our transfer partners feel the same way.

Chemistry wrote this resolution, but we are confident that other disciplines, languages come to mind, might feel the same way.

Since there is currently NO WAY to choose which courses in the CVC we will accept for transfer (it is all or nothing) we are asking that a process be created.   In addition, as noted in the whereas parts, this is also a violation of the curriculum process as we are being FORCED to accept curriculum over which we had no input or approval.

The details of the process will have to be worked out, but in general, it should be that any college in the CVC will still have to approve courses, on a course by course basis, for approval at their local college. NO COURSE SHOULD BE ACCEPTED FOR CREDIT WITHOUT THE APPROVAL OF THE ACCEPTING COLLEGE."

Motion to move the item to the December 12th meeting as Old Business for discussion and potential vote:
M/S   Sardo/Hoffman

IX.   OLD BUSINESS:

A.   Reconsideration of Exceptions to the Brown Act – AB 361: Crocitti

1.   Approval allows the SDMC AS Committees to meet virtually in December 2022 without having to adhere to the Brown Act's stringent requirements for teleconferencing.

Motion to Approve:

M/S   Fremland/Sardo   **30 APPROVE**
Abbiate
(Proxy to Naimark)
Mapes
(Proxy to Abe)

B.   Revisit Faculty Hiring Prioritization (FHP) Rubric – Rejected by SDMC AS During Fall 2022: Crocitti

1.   Alison Gurganus reported that she met with committee and received assurances.
   a.   Alison will vote to approve the rubric today.
2.   President John Crocitti reported the proposed rubric came from the Planning and Institutional Effectiveness Committee (PIEC).
   a.   PIEC proposed the same rubric for the following:
     - Budget and Allocation of Resources (BARC)
     - Classified Hiring Prioritization (CHP)
     - Faculty Hiring Prioritization (FHP)
   b.   The FHP Committee reduced the number of criteria from seven (7) to five (5).
     - FHP also revised the language of the rubric.
   c.   President John Crocitti said this is a test case about "Shared.Participatory Governance".
3.   Rob Fremland asked if BARC/CHP/FHP are supposed to develop their own individual rubrics and ask their constituents for feedback before bringing each rubric forward to PIEC.
4.   As reported by Rob Fremland:
"From where I sit, this is about the process for FHP. At least that's what the resolution is about. From what I'm hearing, the "one form to rule them all" concept came from PIE and specifically the IE office. However, the FHP process was ALWAYS supposed to originate in FHP as were any revisions. What we are trying to codify with the resolution is that it should go to senate before approval.
BARC, CHP and program review really should do the same thing. However, I think CHP processes would be under the purview of the Classified Senate. Program review is broader than faculty so that makes senate's approval of the process up for discussion. This pertains to BARC as well. Perhaps in discussion of the resolution in senate, we can include other processes as well. As they are linked, it does make sense.

At the inception of the linking of resource allocation to program review (Jeez, this sounds like accreditationspeak) and the creation of PIE, it was ALWAYS intended that each process would do its own revisions and get final approval from PIE and then PCAB. It was NEVER intended to be top down.

That's my perspective.
Rob"

5. As reported by Alison Gurganus:
"Hello All,

I have a question, is our difficulty with the FHP committee specifically, or is it with the process being used to create the entire comprehensive Program Review document? We are now using that one document for FHP, CHP, and BARC. I am unclear where the document actually originates from and the hands it goes through to get to us in the end. Surely, FHP is not the body creating every section of the Program Review document? ...and if they are, why? They should only be focused on FHP or be a part of the larger conversation along with the CHP committeee, BARC committee and Program Review Committee. I can tell you, as a member of the Program Review Committee, I never saw this document until it came to the Senate.

If our problem is a larger issue, then perhaps we need to expand the verbiage somehow."

6. President Elected Andrew Hoffman said some Administrators are under the impression that the process was followed by the Faculty Members who serve on the FHP Committee.
Motion to approve the Rubric:

M/S		**10 APPROVE**
		Mapes
		(Proxy to Abe)
		5 Disapprove
		13 Abstain
		Abbiate
		(Proxy to Naimark)

President John Crocitti confirmed with SDMC AS Parliamentarian Manuel Vélez and other resources that the vote is valid.

C. Codify "Shared Governance" Process for Approving Campus-wide Items Including Funding Rubrics:

1. Several SDMC AS members expressed concern about the vetting and approval process for the current Faculty Hiring Prioritization (FHP) funding rubric.

Motion to ask the SDMC AS Executive Committee to draft a resolution regarding the SDMC AS concerns about the deviation from the Shared Governance Process employed to approve the current FHP funding rubric and codifying the SDMC Shared Governance Process:

Motion to Approve:

M/S	G. Johnson/Gurganus	**24 APPROVE**
		Abbiate
		(Proxy to Naimark)
		Mapes
		(Proxy to Abe)

X. **ROUND TABLE TOPIC:**
   A. **Current SDMC Participatory/Shared Governance Process**: Crocitti (Tabled due to Time Constraints)

XI. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**:
   A. The final fall 2022 Academic Senate meeting is December 12, 2022 @ 2:20PM (Zoom Meeting).
   B. The final fall 2022 Academic Affairs Committee meeting is December 5, 2022 @ 4:15PM (Zoom Meeting).
   C. The final fall 2022 Committee of Chairs (CoC) meeting is November 30, 2022 @ 2:30PM in Room MC 211 A/B and Zoom (Hyflex Meeting).
   D. The final fall 2022 Curriculum Review Committee (CRC) meeting is December 1, 2022 @ 2:15PM (Hyflex Meeting).
   E. The final fall 2022 Professional Advancement Committee (PAC) meeting is December 7, 2022 @ 2:30PM (Zoom Meeting).

XII. **Meeting Extensions**:
   A. Motion to Extend the Meeting 15 Minutes Until 4:35PM:

M/S	Braun/G. Johnson	**26 APPROVE**
		Abbiate
		(Proxy to Naimark)
		Mapes
		(Proxy to Abe)
		2 Disapprove

   B. Motion to Extend the Meeting 10 Additional Minutes Until 4:45PM:

M/S	Mayasa/Stojimirovic	**17 APPROVE**
		Abbiate
		(Proxy to Naimark)
		Mapes
		(Proxy to Abe)
		1 Disapprove

XIII. **ADJOURNMENT** @ 4:45PM:
Motion to Adjourn:

M/S	Hoffman/Mayasa	**26 APPROVE**
		Abbiate
		(Proxy to Naimark)
		Mapes
		(Proxy to Abe)

Submitted by Sue Saetia:
Approved by the Academic Senate: December 12, 2022